

| |
|--|
| USDC SDNY DOCUMENT ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOC #: DATE FILED: 7/27/2023 |
|--|

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

WADE MULLEN,

Plaintiff,

- against -

BODUM USA, INC.,

Defendant.

Civil Action No.: 1:23-cv-1166

**STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Plaintiff WADE MULLEN, (“Plaintiff”) and BODUM USA, INC., (“Defendant”) agrees as follows:

1. A. Purposes and Limitations

Discovery in this Action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; the parties will follow the rules and procedures of the Court that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.

B. Good Cause Statement

This action is likely to involve medical records, trade secrets, design documents, patents, research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution and

defense of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling of such material at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order covering such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: this pending federal lawsuit.

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its Counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” Information or Items: extremely sensitive “Confidential Information or Items,” disclosure of which to another Party or Non-Party would create a substantial risk of serious harm that could not be avoided by less restrictive means.

2.9 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a Party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.10 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.11 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a Party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a Party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that Party or are affiliated with a law firm that has appeared on behalf of that Party, and includes support staff.

2.12 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staff).

2.13 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.

2.14 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

2.15 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

2.16 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of materials, documents, items or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the materials, documents, items or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY") (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the documents made available for inspection shall be deemed "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the appropriate legend ("CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY

CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”) to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each portion, the level of protection being asserted.

(b) for testimony given in depositions, that the Designating Party identifies the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition, all protected testimony.

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s Scheduling Order.

6.2 Meet and Confer. In the event a party challenges another party’s designation of confidentiality, counsel shall make a good faith effort to resolve the dispute, and in the absence of a resolution, the Challenging Party may seek resolution by the Court. Nothing in this Protective Order constitutes an admission by any party that Confidential Information disclosed in this case is relevant or admissible. Each party reserves the right to object to the use or admissibility of the Confidential Information.

6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass

or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to judicial intervention. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all Parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 Disclosure of CONFIDENTIAL Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated CONFIDENTIAL only to:

- (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action;
- (b) the partners and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;
- (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for purposes of this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
- (d) the Court and its personnel;
- (e) court reporters, videographers and their staff;
- (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who the Parties agree in writing otherwise already possessed or knew the information;

(h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the witness signs the “Acknowledgement and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A); and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information, unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order;

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by the Parties engaged in settlement discussions; and

(j) any other person to whom the Designating Party agrees in writing or on the record.

7.3 Disclosure of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY only to:

(a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for purposes of this Action;

(b) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for the Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(c) the Court and its personnel;

(d) court reporters, videographers and their staff;

(e) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who the Parties agree in writing otherwise already possessed or knew the information;

(f) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the

Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the witness signs the “Acknowledgement and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A); and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information, unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order;

(f) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by the Parties engaged in settlement discussions;

(g) any other person to whom the Designating Party agrees in writing or on the record

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”), that Party must:

(a) promptly notify the Designating Party in writing. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the entity who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any CONFIDENTIAL or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”) information before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its

confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Stipulated Protective Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated CONFIDENTIAL or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY"). Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this Action is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Stipulated Protective Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify the Requesting Party and the Non-Party in writing that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this Court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the Court.

Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this Court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosure(s), (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to a Receiving Party that inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Party are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the Parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the Parties may incorporate their agreement in the Stipulated Protective Order submitted to the Court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Stipulated Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to the use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Stipulated Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material

must comply with the Court's rules. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the Court, then the Receiving Party may file the Protected Material in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the Court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Plaintiff's counsel may retain a single copy of all papers and documents containing Defendants' Protected Material filed with the Court, and Plaintiff's counsel's own work product (including document used to develop legal thoughts and litigation strategy) that contain Defendants' Protected Material, and such retention will be subject to the express terms of the Stipulated Protective Order and Defendants' Protected Material shall be expressly prohibited from being used in other litigation or for any purpose outside of this litigation. Any such materials, including electronically-held materials, that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION). Plaintiff does not have a right to Defendants' Protected Material.

VIOLATION

Any violation of this Stipulated Protective Order may be punished by appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions and/or equitable

relief.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

Date: July 26, 2023

/s/ Adam J. Kress

Adam J. Kress, Esq.

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

Anna Rick, Esq.

Pro Hac Vice to be filed

444 Cedar Street, Suite 1800

St. Paul, MN 55101

(612) 436-1800 / 612-436-1801 (fax)

akress@johnsonbecker.com

arick@johnsonbecker.com

In association with:

**MILBERG, COLEMAN, BRYSON, PHILLIPS
GROSSMAN, LLC**

Randi Kassan, Esq.

100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500

Garden City, NY 11530

516-741-5600 / 516-741-0128 (fax)

Rkassan@thesandersfirm.com

DATED: July 26, 2023

WILSON ELSEER MOSKOWITZ EDELMAN & DICKER
LLP

By: /s/ Suma S. Thomas

Suma S. Thomas, Esq.

Ernest V. Goodwin, Esq.

Attorneys for Defendant BODUM USA, INC.

1133 Westchester Avenue

White Plains, New York 10604

(914) 872-7307

SO ORDERED.

Dated: July 27, 2023

New York, New York



ANALISA TORRES
United States District Judge